

**Public Minutes of the Board of Assessors  
Special Meeting of March 2, 2020**

**Members Present:**

Daniel Hansberry

Robert Earley

Paul Bergeron

**Assessing Staff Present:**

Greg Turgiss

Douglas Dame

Gary Turgiss

Michael Mandile

Louise Brown

Amanda Mazerolle

Lynn Cameron

**Other City of Nashua Staff Present:**

Administrative Services Director Kimberly Kleiner, Corporation Counsel Steve Bolton, Finance Manager Janet Graziano

**State of New Hampshire DRA Members Present:**

James Gerry

Sam Greene

Adam Denoncour

**Vision Staff Present:**

June Perry

Stephen Whalen

Rick Kulp

John Michael Tarello

**Mr. Hansberry**

Welcome to the Special Board of Assessors meeting March 2, 2020. Present to my right is Robert Earley, to my left Paul Bergeron, myself Daniel Hansberry. Also joining us from the City, to Mr. Earley's right would be Steven Bolton, City Corporation Counsel for the City of Nashua; to Mr. Bergeron's left is Kim Kleiner, Director of Administrative Services, and part of her responsibility is oversight of the Assessing Department and to Ms. Kleiner's left is Janet Graziano, who's in charge of the Finance Department for the City.

I would ask the people from the State if they could introduce themselves please.

**Mr. Gerry**

My name is James Gerry, I'm the Director of the Municipal and Property Division of the Department of Revenue

**Mr. Greene**

I'm Sam Greene, I'm the Assistant Director

Mr. Denoncour

And I'm Adam Denoncour, I'm East District Supervisor.

Mr. Hansberry

I would ask the people from Solutions if they could also introduce themselves please.

Mr. Kulp

I'm Richard Kulp with Vision, Crew Chief.

Ms. Perry

I'm June Perry, Project Manager

Mr. Whalen

Steven Whalen, Project Manager

Mr. Tarello

Mike Tarello, Vice President Appraisal Operations

Mr. Hansberry

Thank you. For members of the public there are handouts of the materials that's going to be addressed on the side table just beyond the map and screen, if you are looking for materials. At this time I'm going to turn the meeting over to the Department of Revenue Administration, they have some opening comments they'd like to make.

Mr. Greene

Thank you. So again, my name is Sam Greene, Assistant Director, kind of in charge of the Assessing side of Municipal and property; James kind of deals with the tax rate side; those are our 2 sides of the team.

We serve, the Department of Revenue has 3 primary functions on the assessing side. One is to perform duties related to assessment review; which is really a function of the Assessing Standards Board. We are administratively attached to the Assessing Standards Board. We are boots on the ground. We go out and we review property records, whether they be in the field or we're doing cloud review; for instance reviewing current use, exemptions and credits; the ability of a town to pick up, do a good job, picking up properties as of April 1, which is the pickup, or the as of assessment date in the State of New Hampshire. That's one thing we do, Adam will talk about that towards the end. We also provide education. We've had Dan and Bob and I think yup Kim. We've had a few people in the room who have attended our classes. We hold mini courses around the state. We're going to be in the near future, holding a mini course on overview of assessing in Hollis; so not too far away. We hold these courses on current use, exemptions and credits, timber and gravel and a variety of topics. The other thing is we hold classes on State Statutes. There's a State Statutes I class, which is put on by the Assessors in the state and a State Statutes II class which we put on. And then for Assessors who are trying to keep their designation they have to meet a certain number of certification requirements in a 5-year period so we do a one-day update. Steve's been there, Rick's been there, June's been there, John's been there. Welcome everybody. The third item and the part I'm going to be talking about is

revaluations. Basically, make sure that revaluations take place as required by the constitution and the Statute once, at least as often as every 5 years. So, a lot of the small towns in the state, you know reappraisals of property can be expensive but so a lot of the small towns are just every 5 years if they can get away with it. Some of the larger towns that have seen bigger shifts in the tax burden are doing revaluations more often than every 5 years. Particularly those on water front, so the Moultonborough's for example of the world, do revaluations just about every year. Why are they doing that? They're capturing the value of the water front. The value of the water front is going up like this where as the rest of the town is going up at a slower rate or even going down. It's a requirement at least as often as every 5 years. We rarely, rarely is there a time when a town is forced to do something more often than every 5 years. But occasionally that happens, when there's been a revaluation that's gone south very quickly and the model is just not working. So, there's been a handful of times in the last 15 years that I can think of where a town's has been required to do a revaluation more often.

You folks are on a 5 year, 2018 was your last one and the next plan one is 2023. This is a little bit deceiving, a little bit unusual; we usually have a startup meeting with a revaluation, and that's usually when values are going to be changed, in this year for instance. We are starting this primarily because of everything that went into this particular project to just really talk about the cyclical inspection work that's going to be going on and I will be turning it over shortly to the assessors. But to kind of review the topics of the contract and I would think that it would be a good idea on the Boards part and we will probably request it, to do a new start up meeting in 2 years just prior to, basically the year where you're setting numbers. That's the much more complicated year. That's going to be when they're going to be looking at sales, doing sales analysis, doing field reviews, holding informal hearings; it's going to be the meatiest part the next 3 years. But over the next 3 years there's going to be cyclical inspection work. Those are the predominant questions I have for the assessors, and you may have for the assessors as to how they're going to conduct business? What's they're motives operandi on going out and visiting properties, trying to get interior inspections? Is there going to be a call back process etcetera? Just so that the public is aware we have a list of employees. Employees have to be approved by the Department of Revenue. The Department of Revenue has 2 big areas where we are responsible and give us the ability to kind of control what's happening in the assessing world in the State of NH; 1 is to approve all contracts and 2 is to approve, certify all the people that are in the assessing world, doing work here in NH. And just so you are aware, I think everybody at the table is...we have Rick's Assessor level, everybody else is Supervisory level. So, a supervisor in the State of NH, you need to be a supervisor to set values. They're just part of the team. Rick's got the ability to work with a CAMA system. A CAMA system is a Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal system. Yours is I believe is going to be Patriot. Then there's going to be the boots on the ground people; those are going to be predominantly measure and listers and assessor assistants. What's the total, I think about 8 people, Mike?

Mr. Tarello

Yes, 8 or 9.

Mr. Greene

Again, we're going to just pretty quickly cover the measuring and listing which is all that is going on this year. That's not to say that there's not general assessing work going on that the town's personnel's presumably involved with or a combination of the personnel and Vision.

I do have, I did want to kind of start, that's the letter for assessment review. I kind of want to start with where you folks stand statistically and again since you're not doing a revaluation this year it's not like this is going to change dramatically. Just to kind of give you an idea of where the market's been versus 2018, your ratio study, which is how we track, it's basically a comparison of assessed values to sales that have gone on. Typically, when you have a ratio of

less than 100%, that means the market is outpacing the level of assessments, and we would expect that right. In Nashua the markets been continuing to going up, in Portsmouth in..audible ..and way up north, maybe it's trickling every market is a little bit different..audible... Your any and all, so that's basically all properties combined for this statistic is, so residential, condos, mobile homes, commercial, industrial, is at just a little bit under 89% which is not too bad given the fact that it's been a year and half, we know the market keeps going up. More importantly, and impressively, is that your COD is at 8%, so that means the dispersion from that is still below 10, which is something we look for. We start looking the year after the reval. But with the market moving over the course of time that number tends to go up. So, we've had a few towns where that number has gone well up over 10, even up in the 20 range and a couple of years after a reval, that means that there are some properties that are being over/under assessed 20 points away from each other. And we note, and that some of these are pretty predictable. We've got manufactured housing without land at 77%. The manufactured housing without land and there's probably not a lot of slaes, well 31 valid sales. So, they're essentially being assessed at 77% of their value. So, they've actually outpaced the single family. Now why is that? The low-end housing, affordable housing now is apartments and mobile homes. That's kind of an interesting thing, we got land that's about 80% and then commercial is topping 101%. The commercial is essentially not, hasn't increased in value like residential properties in the last year and a half ago.

So just a few questions and then I'm just going to turn it over to Vision; some of these will probably be answered by Vision as I'm going along. A couple of things I just want to check on, are you folks, I don't believe it's in your contract, what's happening with utility values? Utility values usually, a lot of times are done by a different assessor or appraiser? Has that been discussed at all?

Attorney Bolton

The SanSoucy firm will be doing the utility values.

Mr. Greene

Okay. We'd just be looking for a contract from him. If he's not doing it on an annual basis, we'd expect to see one for that year, the year of the revaluation.

Attorney Bolton

It is being done on an annual basis by that firm. I believe you've seen the contract. The contract calls for it to be done by 2023, we're going to have it done by 2022 to match what we're doing with Vision.

Mr. Greene

Are there any other special use properties that are not being done? I don't believe this is the case but I'm just asking the question. Like some amusement park that you guys don't want anything to do with?

Mr. Tarello

No.

Mr. Greene

So, you're doing all other property.

Mr. Tarello

Yes.

Mr. Greene

So basically, the supervisors in charge of the project are Mike and June, to my knowledge, unless one of you, you guys are pointing at each other.

Mr. Tarello

No, Steve will do a lot of the commercial and June will do a lot of the residential. And I'll help out.

Mr. Greene

Okay. So we're going to call June, or both of you supervisors in charge.

So the work, the term of the contract is 20, 21, 22. I may have misspoken and mentioned 2023, but it is 2022 is the game plan for values anew. My checklist is very short because a lot of these questions really have to do with 22 and what's happening then.

I wanted to just briefly talk about how we review their work okay. I'm kind of putting the cart before the horse a little bit. They're going to be going out and looking at a 1/3 of the properties roughly over the next 3 years. Whether that's been broken out as to what 1/3 going to be, what year I'm not certain about; maybe they can speak to it. Adam who is the East District Supervisor and his staff will be reviewing a certain portion of those properties every year. Our traditional sampling is usually in the neighborhood of 12 properties per year. That may seem like a small number, we can do more properties but we have man power... Basically even in a large town we tend to do a sampling of a dozen properties per year. Essentially, we're doing what they're doing. We are going out; we do a post card mailing beforehand to property owners that were visited. We go out and basically make sure that their people are walking around the house. Their people are qualified to do the work that they are assigned. An example of something that they may not be qualified would be if a measure and lister goes out and then is setting a grade for instance, like the grade of a property, he can comment on a grade, maybe on the property record card, but it's these folks right here that should be grading property as far as the quality of the property, condition of the property, effective year built and that kind of thing. The boots on the ground again, they'll be measuring, they'll be making note of one story, two stories, ranch, colonial, sheds; doing all that; the basic description of the property. For anybody who is not familiar with this, Nashua is probably the, has some of the oldest data as far as there being as systematic measuring and listing of all the properties in town. I know that the administration has been doing a lot in prior year working with fly over data; I'm not saying there has been no attempt to pick up data but this is a systematic data collection effort to visit every single property in the community. I think it's really going to benefit the work product because it's comprehensive and it's going to be all collected during a short period of time. Whereas picking up 500 sales last year and 500 sales 5 years ago and different people in the office you're going to end up with inconsistent data collection. We're going to go

out and look at properties when we do what we call our monitoring we'll ask June for a list of properties that were visited in 2020. We'll do our random sample from the entire community or really not the entire community by the group they saw this past year. They will, we will then do a random sample and Adam or somebody will be out collecting that data for ourselves and comparing it, make sure there's no errors. We do allow, we have kind of a standard error sheet which I don't have a copy with me today, but we have a sheet that would say for instance Mike charged 5 data error points, if there's a substantial difference in value. He may only charge 1 point if the deck that's 3 feet off. It's kind of based on the relative importance but in general we're looking for good data collection. When we finish our monitoring report, we provide the assessors with a copy for them to review and comment on in case maybe they didn't have an interior inspection that we thought they had and then we'll get a comment back from the assessors and then we'll report to you folks.

I know that there's going to be a data collection manual discussed so I'm going to skip over that and maybe we may have some questions for you in a second on that. One of my questions would be should we be talking to June if we need property record cards? Who would be the best point person as you go through, when you finish your 2020?

Ms. Perry

Oh, yeah, me.

Mr. Greene

Okay. Are you guys doing anything in-house? Do you need a secure work space? And if you do is there one?

Ms. Perry

It's been provided already.

Mr. Greene

What?

Ms. Perry

It's been provided already.

Mr. Greene

Okay. I would imagine you're doing a lot of stuff remotely.

Ms. Perry

As far as the data collection goes, we're doing it here.

Mr. Greene

Okay good, and whose doing data entry of that data collection?

Ms. Perry

Vision will be doing it and we will be remoting into their system.

Mr. Greene

Into their Patriot system? Okay. So, you guys will be responsible for all your...

Ms. Perry

Yes.

Mr. Greene

I'm going to ask this question even though it's probably part of your data collection manual, do you have a systematic way you report on a visit to a property? Specifically, who was at the property, why they were at the property and the result of that visit was?

Ms. Perry

Uh-hum.

Mr. Greene

Okay, one of my big things. We've covered special use properties and utility property. That's really all I have for now I'm going turn it over to you folks to talk about data collection and then we can put on our other hat and I'll let Adam talk about assessment review which won't be to long a presentation.

Mr. Tarello

I'm just going to go over to the podium, we have a little PowerPoint...*inaudible*.

The hardest part is just to make sure I push the button the right way so we go forward; the other button. I had a 50% chance and I failed.

My name is Mike Tarello as I said earlier and I'm with Vision Appraisal and I have been with them since 1987. I know it. I actually worked here in the 90's so I'm familiar with the facility here and the City. I just want to go through and talk a little bit about the process that we have today and what we're going to cover in the first year of the reval, well actually the first 2 years. So, the measure and list is going to occur in 2020 and 21, it'll take a little bit over 2 years to get it all finalized. This has been mandated by the State to be done. It's a 3-year program. We'll be doing a lot of the collecting in 2020 and 2021 and then we'll be doing most of the analysis in 2022. Again, there's over 28,000 parcels that we'll be dealing with.

What are the benefits of this process? Basically, the major benefits and Sam had talked about a little bit with the COD over the years; properties go up at different variable amounts and percentages. This will correct any disproportionate taxation that occurs; it'll adjust for values for market shifts as he had mentioned; will capture all the new construction that's going on and of course with all the computerized, putting the data in it gives good access to the information and then we achieve the 100% or close to 100% assessment ratio that's required.

The data collection is the crucial part of the valuation process because it's the foundation of getting the values accurate because of the data being accurate. The more the information is

picked up correctly the more accurate it can be in valuing the final assessments. Some of the things that we'll be collecting interior are bedrooms/bathroom counts, attics and basements, exterior measurements, any out building that occur, land characteristics, topography, access, all those different variables.

We have a staff of data collectors, at any time, we'll probably start out with 2 or 3, and we'll have as many as 4 or 5 here depending on the time frame. We'll have Rick, will be the crew chief who'll manage the team and do the quality control. Again, the key to it is accurate measurements; that's something the team will have guidelines on measuring and making sure that everything is picked up correctly. The exterior inspections, we'll make sure the style is appropriate. They'll be noting any quality things that they question, but again the quality will be determined by our group here at a later date when we go out and review. We use the data collectors to give us information and notes and information to assist us, especially if they get into the property so that we know exactly what they know in regards to what is in the interior of the property. We'll be looking at story levels, story heights, roof structure, roof cover, wall construction, making sure the year built is correct, and then they'll be giving notes again on what they feel the conditions of the properties are and then pick up any outbuildings; garages, sheds and so forth.

We feel that the homeowner participation is really one of the more important aspects of it. We consider the homeowners part of the revaluation process; during the inspection process and also during the informal hearing process. The more information that we can gather from them and the more cooperative they are the better the project will go. And then we'll be looking, as we do get into the properties, again room counts, bath counts, bedroom counts, wall finish, floor finish, heating systems, styles and conditions of the bathrooms and the kitchens. Pretty much a thorough look at the whole process to make sure we've collected all the important variables that go into the valuation process.

Once this is all completed and data entered and quality controlled, we'll start the process of doing the analysis. One of the major things that we do with analysis is analyzing qualified sales. We will go through and do an in-depth study of the town sales; we'll work with the assessors to qualify the sales to make sure that they're true arms-length transactions; we'll determine land pricing, land values; through the sales and what's called sales residuals, which are basically sales that have occurred with the building cost being extracted out of them to give us the value of the land, an indicator of the value of the land. We'll be looking at building costs and depreciation and through all this analysis we'll go through, through the sales and through geographical areas; there are neighborhoods now identified, we'll go through them to see if they need to be changed and adjusted based on the sales data and we'll delineate those neighborhoods. We'll use this through the computer model and we'll set up all the developed rates that determine the adjustments we need.

Through this process; basically, it's the 3 approaches to value that we use. The sales approach is very pertinent for single family properties, 2 families, 3 families, the residential properties, condominiums. Cost approach can be helpful on new construction to determine cost and if there's a new land values, those items will assist us in determining the base cost for the construction of colonials and capes and so forth; and the income approach is more pertinent to the commercial and industrial properties. This is where we look at income stream, deduct vacancy and expenses, and capitalize that net income for a value. This is where we will get income and expense information, leasing information, capitalization surveys and so forth, to value those properties. This information basically as stated is the sales that occur, we're



going be looking at sales from 4/1/2021 to 3/31/2022 as our basis for the data for the sales. For the commercials we may look a little bit further back just to get an idea of some of the trends going on because commercials, we don't get as many sales. We'll be looking at the income and expense information, we'll be sending that out to the community in early 2022 to gather information from 2021 leases and helping us determine market rents and rates for the various types of properties being retail, office, industrial, apartments and so forth. Once we have gathered all this information and we've set some preliminary rates, we'll go out and review all the properties through drive by inspections. This is where we'll look for equity and consistency of the quality of construction, condition, the styles being comparable, and look at the data that was collected now more as a valuation process along with another thorough look at the data to make sure that it's accurate. We'll have the inspectors go out; we'll have the quality control go; the Department of Revenue will look at the data and then our analysts and appraisers will again look at the data and then we'll determine the values and then of course, we'll do the informal hearing process where we send the values out, give the ability for the tax payers to come in and give us even more information on the property so that we have another look it. So, it's a very complete and thorough process of determining the data being correct, the values being accurate and them being equitable.

The informal hearing process, again, that will go out in mid-2022 and then we'll have the hearings in August 2022 and then we'll probably be wrapping up around September of 2022. So pretty much just about a 3-year process and then your abatement applications would be due the following year by March 1.

Of course, we are using the web for public relations; we have put items already, a description of the process that's going on and what we're going to be doing is already on the website. We will be continuously adding to that, having meetings anything public relations that the City feels is necessary to keep communication open with the taxpayers. And then we'll be doing status reports and so forth for the City and for the Department of Revenue so that they know where we stand so we'll have a strong transparency of where we are at. Again, with this, it's a public awareness, public relations, published values during the hearing process, these are all things we can put on the web and assist in the clean-up of things so that we can make sure that everything is out there for the assessors. We'll be taking phone calls from our office and our data bank center so it'll be a lot of information that'll be out there to help the process go smoothly.

Okay, that's what we have right now. I'll sit back down and then I'll answer some questions so I'm not just behind everyone's back.

Mr. Hansberry

Thank you.

Mr. Greene?

Mr. Greene

I just have a couple of follow up questions for clarity. You have a parcel count, how many of those are vacant land and I'm assuming you're driving by vacant land?

Mr. Tarello

Right, we'll be checking those to make sure that they're still vacant and what the topography and so forth is. I'd have to look at the count, I'm not sure.

Ms. Perry

I don't have that off the top of my head.

Mr. Greene

Yeah okay just to clarify. Are you guys doing all the data collection relative to pick-ups or is that being done City staff?

Ms. Perry

We are doing it after of April 1<sup>st</sup> of this year.

Mr. Greene

I may have strayed for a second and not heard this, what's your process for, if you're at a property, knock on the door and nobody's at home? Is there an automatic second visit and/or a call back, it is something slated for a callback?

Mr. Tarello

We're going to send out letters. So, we're going to do the inspections and then walk through the whole City and do all the inspections, the ones we get in, the ones we get in. Then what we're going to do based on the wards and so forth, as we finish an area, cause we're not going to do it all at once; we're going to send letters out, and then do those appointments and so forth, while we're doing that we'll be moving onto the next area and then do that. So that we stay consistent and we're not doing thousands of letters at the end cause it's such a large City, we're going to break it up into areas. Which is good too because the team will have just been there, so they pretty much, say 2 or 3 weeks later they're about to go out, they're starting the 2<sup>nd</sup> ward, they can set up appointments for them not too far away.

Mr. Greene

So, from the Board, I would just, for public relations stand point, and the Boards stands, as much as you guys can get the word out that property owners assisting the assessors, having an assessor come into the property, for accuracy stand point, is key. Now you're not going to get into, you know, there's going to be some percentage you know, not everybody is going to let you into the property but the more you guys as a Board and you as a City can promote the idea that interior inspections can help with accuracy in assessing, the better. One thing I wanted to say, to ask as a follow up, I was going to bring it up 2 years from now so I'll bring it up now. For final review is that going to be done with your final review, quality control and testing, will all that be done with supervisors, are you going to do a field review or a desk review?

Mr. Tarello

Field review, with qualified staff. We'll have more guidelines for that, we're going to get all this for you for your input and guidance and so forth, and of course approval from the Board. But everything is standard, we have the data collection standards; we have standards for field

review; we have standards for entering income and expense information; we have standards for setting the rates and so forth and every step along the way is approved by the Board and then also given to you for review. So, you can see the steps that we're doing. We are extremely transparent. We've been doing this way too long. This is a great team. We're experienced in doing this in major cities, like I said we were here before. We're pretty comfortable with the process of doing it, but it's a team effort on all aspects because we know the process but no one knows the City better than the Assessing staff. We would be relying on them a lot for their approval and guidance in setting up these guidelines and making sure they're consistent. And like anything, as we get out there, we going to modify some of these things and adjust them as we go along. We will continue to get that to you guys, cause you've been too it a long time and have experience on it and it helps us to have that transparency and communication for a successful job.

Mr. Greene

That's all I got.

Mr. Hansberry

Did you say that Adam wanted to address us?

Mr. Greene

Yea. Adam is going to talk about the assessment review process.

Mr. Denoncour

First thing I want to say is it's entirely separate. It's kind of just a coincident that it's happening at the same time. The last time it was done was 2015, and we do it once every 5 years. It's a process that was created in statute. We get the standards; it's essentially a test that was created by the Assessing Standards Board that we crop. Much of it is done in the field, some of it is done in the assessing office and some of it is done in our office. I have handouts for you guys.

Mr. Greene

We got 2 things for you; we have some packets for the board members and also a handout I can get to everybody which is kind of a brief synopsis.

Mr. Denoncour

My boss was nice enough to come.

On the first page there is a chart I'll be referring to, it has 6 columns so in statute it identified 6 assessing areas...*inaudible*.. It's all there; it's not really in a format that's my favorite. So, I prefer to think of it as in the field, in your office and in our office. In the field we would be looking at your pick-ups. That is properties that have changes, where they needed a value change as of April 1. So, we'll be taking a sample of properties that Vision visits, this coming spring and going out and visiting them. Almost the same process as monitoring, but the key is that we're looking to make sure that the value is correct as of April 1. If there was something that was in the process of being constructed that they have the right percentage of

construction on it or if there was something that was half built on April 1<sup>st</sup> that they have that correctly at 50%. We're not going to be able to be there on April 1, and largely neither are they; there's only so many places you can be at once. So, there's a lot of estimating or using knowledge of what's going on involved. So, we might be there a month or two after them; we'll obviously take that into consideration if we're taking a look at it and they could be further along than what they saw. But at the end of the day, I'm likely going to wait until we get the final cards for this year, since you'll be doing it all summer long. Once you file the MS-1, your cards are final then I'll be taking what we looked at and ...*inaudible*...against what your final value was for 2020. We also do data accuracy which is just a complete sample of properties in town. We'll take the universal parcel numbers that we get from the equalization upload; we'll just strike out all the maintenance and improvement properties. We'll visit them and try to make interiors when we can. We'll just do a survey of every single physical data point on the property record card to ensure its accuracy. If there is anything that is incorrect, the standard that ASB came up for that accuracy is actually a percentage of value either on the land or on the improvement or both. If it's either on the land or the improvement it needs to be greater than 7.5% of that value for it to be considered material error or 5.5% of the whole property. That's a pretty significant error if it gets to 7.5%. Most of the time we don't find a great many of them but that is our standard for that. So, if there's a deck that's off by 3 feet we probably won't reach that level of material error.

In your office, we'll be looking at credits and exemption files just to make sure that there's a properly PA-29 that's signed by the applicant, that it's signed by the Board; if they're in a trust, that they have a PA-33 on file and we'll be looking to make sure that they have all been reviewed in the last 5 years; either re-qualified sometimes in the case of elderlies or Veteran's to make sure that their still living or living in town they still need to qualify. Same with Blind, I don't know if anyone's ever going to see again, but we want to make sure they're still living in town, they still qualify. When we take a look at the institutional exemptions, the Religious, Educational and Charitable exemptions to make sure they have a current A-9 and in the case of Charitable's that they have a current A-12, an that's that. For Current Use we'll be looking to make sure that there's a recorded A-10 or the application; that there's a map that outlines the non-current use and current use categories or applicable. And then we make sure that the equalization ration is properly applied and that the land is being graded per CUB 304, which is the Marvel Decision; that it's not all at the same level; which it's pretty common for it to be rated. We also want to make sure if they are in stewardship, if they're managed, I'm not sure how many you have, but that they have updated stewardship information or a RSU 12 document.

We also have a couple of questionnaires, about access to public records. It generally relates to how much, how ready your information is. If someone came in and asked for a property record card could they get it? If they ask for the most recent USPAP manual could they get it? Things like that. That's directly related to 91A. We also have some of your inventory program. That is the program that you use to identify properties that had a change, whether its information that comes from your building department or any other means that you might find that properties have had a physical change, lot line adjustment, subdivision, things like that. You flag those to make sure the assessors go out and make the needed changes; we just want to make sure there is a program like that in place.

The final part is done in our office. The first 3 parts of that are just statistics; which is what Sam talked about earlier a little bit. We look at median ratio making sure it's between 90 and 110%. We look at co-efficient dispersion to make sure it's under 20 and we look at price related

differential make sure it's between .98 and 1.03. As it stands right now the ratio is outside of that range which is, in this market typical, if you're not doing assessment reviews in the same year as your update. It's not necessarily an issue but we're already ...*inaudible*... Beyond that we are looking for a USPAP manual that's compliant and your last one from KRT is compliant. So that is very good. And that if you're contracting with any assessing contractor that we've seen a copy of the contract before they even start working, and here we are today. So, you're 2 for 3 so far. Over the next probably 8 months, we'll be doing, starting the field work and moving on to the file work probably the following winter. I'm certainly open to, and I'd love to come back in and talk to Louise and Kim, about more specifically about what we're looking for just to make sure you guys have an idea of when I come in what I'm looking for. And that's about the size of assessment review.

Mr. Hansberry

Thank you. Mr. Greene?

Mr. Greene

I just have one follow up. I just wanted to kind of point out the fact that between these two processes between monitoring, we're going to be looking at a dozen properties for each of the next 3 years as well as a at least a dozen sales in the year of the revaluation. So roughly 48 property in monitoring assessments. And then on the assessment review side of things, we'll be looking at about 35 properties and again that's a random sample of the entire City for this year and then on top of that probably another 35 plus properties that are building permit property issues. It's a specific review of property record cards that where there's a building permit filed sometime last year to make sure that the progress of the work as of April 1 of this year is accurately reflected on the property record card. So, there's quite a few properties that we're actually going to be out, visit for a variety of reasons.

Mr. Denoncour

We're going to avoid overlap so somebody doesn't get 2 of our postcards or 3 or 4 in a 2-year period. But they will obviously be visited at some point by Vision and you may well get the same person visited by us. We're going to send them out postcards in advance certainly, but any notification you can do to let people know you'll be out, from Vision would be great...*inaudible*.. We're going to double dip a couple so...

Mr. Hansberry

You're all set?

Mr. Denoncour

Yep.

Mr. Hansberry

Mr. Bergeron, Mr. Earley do you have any questions?

Mr. Earley

Yes, I have a couple questions. The 12 inspections, you mentioned a 1/3, a 1/3 and a 1/3 but the inspections that Vision will be doing is over 2 years, so is it going to be ½ and ½?

Mr. Greene

Well I kind of got the impression; I think that it's very likely that they'll still be doing inspections in 2022. My understanding was, and it may not be a 1/3 a 1/3 and a 1/3 but there'll be inspections in 20, 21, and 22. And so in 22 what I would kind of expect probably will be the case will be that Adam and/or one of his people will be out looking at that last group of inspections that were done for the cyclical inspection schedule and then they'll also be going out and looking at a dozen sales inspections. The sales are being used as a benchmark for everybody. We want to make sure that Vision is doing an accurate job of collecting information on the sales, really, probably most importantly, because if you have junk in the model you'll end up with a lousy, lousy CAMA system.

Mr. Earley

I was wondering with the 1<sup>st</sup> 12 if you waited a year, or maybe 10 months into it if you caught something that was being mishandled, say, wouldn't it be better to nip it in the bud if you did in 6 months or 3 months even, not do 12, but a smaller number to make sure everything is done according to your standards.

Mr. Greene

There's not a hard a fast rule that we be 100% done with the first year's inspection work. The only thing I would say it doesn't make sense to go out, and look at the work until the MS-1 is filed we know its actually in the system. We don't really know...*inaudible*...That's something that we can bring that forward to our schedule of events for this fall.

Mr. Denoncour

That's why we break it down by year so there's at least an end point there where we can slip in, get a bunch of property record cards, visit them before they go out again.

Mr. Earley

Okay, thank you.

Mr. Tarello

We'll also give status reports on what we've collected and entered into the system so they'll know what wards in the area have been completed.

Mr. Hansberry

Mr. Bergeron?

Mr. Bergeron

No, questions.

Mr. Hansberry

Do any staff members at the table or in the audience have any questions?

Any of the Aldermen?

Alderman Klee?

Ms. Klee

A quick question for you Adam, when you were talking about the exemptions and credits, I didn't see solar?

Mr. Denoncour

That's definitely included in the exemptions. Any exemption type that the City has adopted; what we are going to do is take a random sample, we'll get it down to all the exemptions that are given in town, and we'll take a random sample, we may not get any of that particular type cause there may not be that many but we'll make sure that they complies with all the statutes.

Ms. Klee

Okay, I just hadn't seen it on your list. The other question that I had I think it was relative to what was just asked about the 10 months of a visit and so on. If you know who already has been visited, even though you don't have that MS-1 and you don't have that card, wouldn't it be beneficial for you to go out and just do the inspection as if you were just doing it yourself and then compare your data when the MS-1 came in.

Mr. Denoncour

Yup.

Ms. Klee

Keeping it more real-time rather than waiting 10 months after you've gotten the cards and then picking them and going out.

Mr. Greene

We wouldn't wait 10 months. We want to make sure that when we're reporting back to them, and saying "Oh, you missed this deck", if in fact that deck was added, we want to make sure that they had the, using their processes; they had time to get the deck on the property record card or their CAMA system. Just want to make sure it's comparing apples to apples.

Mr. Hansberry

Alderwomen Schmidt, or Alderwomen Garthright any questions? No.

We'll open it up now for public question and comment; if you can state your name and address and use the microphone.

Ms. Ortolano

I'm going to slide over here so I can see and not just behind everyone. Laurie Ortolano, 41 Berkeley Street. Couple things; when will the GIS update be done with the new pictures

without the foliage cause will you use GIS pictures to help confirm what you're looking at for properties?

Mr. Hansberry

Mrs. Kleiner

Ms. Kleiner

We will have a flight this coming spring that will replace the pictures that were done that had foliage.

Ms. Ortolano

Okay, and will Vision use GIS data, will you be using that for exterior work? I'm just curious.

Mr. Tarello

We'll be going right to the properties and taking photos, doing inspections there. But we do use GIS and Pictometry and so forth, when we do valuations.

Ms. Ortolano

Okay. The map you gave us is Ward 1 and I presume you're sort of marching through the City ward by ward to try to get through each one, whatever you get done is that correct?

Ms. Perry

Yes.

Ms. Ortolano

You mentioned that you're going to be doing the input as after the annual inventory, after the April 1<sup>st</sup> date or you're going to pick it up at that point. Let's say our inventory isn't finished by April 1<sup>st</sup> because in a big City it's very hard to do that so are you going to be picking up permits and sales data that is in this year 2020, that's occurring after April 1<sup>st</sup> or are our assessors going to be handling the input to the computer on that data?

Ms. Perry

As of 4/1 this year, the assessors will be handling it. We'll be doing it after that.

Ms. Ortolano

So, from now to 4/1 the assessors are on, after 4/1 whatever's not picked up, you're on?

Ms. Perry

Right, after this year has been closed out.

Ms. Ortolano



Okay perfect. Are you going to be resetting, I noticed that you mentioned that supervisors are the ones that determine the subjective criteria, the depreciation, the grade, the condition. Are you going to be making determinations on properties on those factors when you're out in the field for each group you look at now to try and address the depreciation issue we have in the City?

Mr. Tarello

What we're going to do is, we'll make determinations on it but the team that's out there will gather information for us and put notes and comments and so forth, because they're there at the time. Statute we are required as supervisors to make the decisions and so forth in the value but we're doing it based on the information they provide.

Ms. Ortolano

So, what I'm wondering is will property owners...let me back track. What I understood is that as you go out and you look sample properties or you do Ward 1 and you get into homes and you see there's an extra bathroom or a finished basement, my understanding was that's going to be taxed as you find it. The card will be updated and the property owner will be assessed for those improvements. Will they be assessed for this subjective data as well or you going to handle that all at the end?

Mr. Tarello

That'll be handled at the end; so this is just the physical data corrections.

Ms. Ortolano

You're going to do physical.

Mr. Tarello

Yeah.

Ms. Ortolano

Okay that's good. Cause I think it could be a real deterrent if some of that gets set.

Mr. Tarello

We've discussed that and talked it, it'd be better doing it at the end it'll be more consistent.

Ms. Ortolano

Yes, okay that's great. Will property owners be given letters if their assessments are changing? We have a policy within the district that if it's not more, if it's not more than \$20,000 we don't send a letter out but if it's less than that and it's a change that's being captured by you will they be notified or are they going to not be notified?

Ms. Kleiner

It has been our policy if our assessors are out and they pick up something and it's over \$20,000 that we issue a letter. We haven't discussed this part of it and we may want to handle that differently, but I think that is something that we need to discuss.

Ms. Ortolano

Okay, that's fine.

Mr. Tarello

I'll note that and look into it.

Ms. Ortolano

Okay that's perfect. The data that you're going to be... changes to property record cards. Are you going to be going to the field with a physical property record cards or do you use a tablet?

Mr. Tarello

We'll have physical property record cards.

Ms. Ortolano

Okay, so those will all be marked up and that data will all be returned back to the City?

Mr. Tarello

Oh yeah.

Ms. Ortolano

Perfect. Great. My other questions have to do with modelling but I think that can wait a couple years because that's all going to come down the pike. Thank you very much.

Mr. Tarello

Sure

Mr. Hansberry

Thank you. Other comments or questions from members of the public?

State your name and address please.

Ms. Colquhoun

Laura Colquhoun, 30 Greenwood Drive. I just got one answered because you'll be actually taking the property card to the physical address and checking it out. Will you be also looking over the additional depreciation our assessors are giving out and also the land factors that they're giving out on land?

Mr. Tarello

All that will be reviewed, yes.

Ms. Colquhoun

Okay, what about building permits? I'm noticing we still have a lot of building permits being open and when they close them out like in 2019 for 16 and 17, they're not putting any assessment on the houses. Will you be looking at building permits?

Mr. Tarello

We will be looking at building permits after April 1<sup>st</sup>, 2020 and then I assume that any physical changes will be done in that year.

Ms. Colquhoun

The only other question that I have but I don't know who to address it to. We haven't done a current use audit in Nashua in over 10 years. Is it possible that we can do an audit to make sure that all these properties are being currently, correctly taxed?

Ms. Kleiner

Sam?

Mr. Greene

If, the audit, there not really any such thing as a current use audit. I would say that if you feel like current use needs to be updated that would probably be the job of your assessing staff or maybe in concert with Vision. We can assist. Certainly, we can come in and do a review. That's one of the things we're going to be reviewing this year anyways.

Ms. Colquhoun

If you look in the files it hasn't been done for 10 years, at that point the City did do it but it's gone astray.

Mr. Greene

I think Adam made the offer that he could come in and talk to the staffers about review. I think that's a good idea anyways to really point out what... it's one thing to say well we're going to review your exemptions, credits and current use but you guys want to know what he's going to be looking for and how you can improve those records. So, I think it would be a good idea if that happened, and he can make some suggestions as to how to update those records. The good news is, unlike a lot of towns, the vast majority of towns in the state, you probably don't have whole lot of current use properties out there.

Ms. Colquhoun

You'll be very surprised we do.

I have one more quick question if I may, Vision? Hold on I got to remember what it is... Single family homes are so valuable in Nashua and apparently, they're being harder hit than like a 2-family home, will you be looking at that? Because I'm looking at 2-family homes that have

1,500 more square feet than I do and they're assessed at \$40,000 less than my home. So, will that be something you can look at?

Mr. Tarello

Certainly, we look at the classes and we also look at the styles within the classes. So even the single families there maybe one that's more desirable than another and then we'll compare those to the 2-families and 3-families.

Ms. Colquhoun

Okay, thank you.

Mr. Hansberry

Other questions or comments?

Ms. Kleiner?

Ms. Kleiner

I just wanted to note, because it was brought up just a little bit ago; because this is a BTLA ordered re-assessment we will be issuing quarterly reports to the BTLA also. So, I know that Mike had mentioned his updates but I just wanted to note that fact as well.

Mr. Hansberry

Any further comments from the State?

Mr. Greene

No comment.

Mr. Hansberry

Vision?

Vision Members in Unison

No.

Mr. Hansberry

You folks are free to go. We just have a few things to finish up. Thank you all very much. We appreciate it.

No communications, correct?

Ms. Kleiner

No communications.

Mr. Hansberry

No staff items?

Ms. Kleiner

No staff items.

Mr. Hansberry

Any unfinished business?

Ms. Kleiner

No unfinished business.

Mr. Hansberry

Is there any comment by the Board?

Mr. Bergeron

No, nothing.

Mr. Hansberry

Is there a need for non-public?

Ms. Kleiner

No, no need.

Mr. Hansberry

Is there a motion to adjourn?

Mr. Earley

I'll make the motion.

Mr. Hansberry

Is there a second?

Mr. Bergeron

I'll second it.

Mr. Hansberry

All those in favor signify by saying aye.

Mr. Bergeron, Mr. Earley & Mr. Hansberry in Unison

Aye.

Mr. Hansberry

Meeting adjourned at 5:00 PM.

Thank you.

DRAFT